



Yannick Poullie

National Action Plans in the Global Governance of Business and Human Rights

The Cases of Sweden and Germany



Nomos

Edition
Rainer
Hampp



Labor and Globalization
Edited by Prof. Dr. Christoph Scherrer

Volume 25

Yannick Poullie

National Action Plans in the Global Governance of Business and Human Rights

The Cases of Sweden and Germany



Nomos

Edition
Rainer
Hampp

Dissertation for the acquisition of the academic degree Doctor of Economic and Social Sciences (Dr. rer. pol.), University of Kassel, Faculty of Social Sciences, 17 November 2021

© Coverpicture: Part of the ceiling painting by Miguel Marceló in the Human Rights and Alliance of Civilizations room, home of the UN Human Rights Council

Picture taken by Yannick Poullie, 2018, used with permission of UN Human Rights.

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Kassel, Univ., Diss., 2021

ISBN 978-3-98542-028-5 (Print)
978-3-95710-399-4 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-98542-028-5 (Print)
978-3-95710-399-4 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Poullie, Yannick

National Action Plans in the Global Governance of
Business and Human Rights

The Cases of Sweden and Germany

Yannick Poullie

550 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-98542-028-5 (Print)
978-3-95710-399-4 (ePDF)



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary

Edition Rainer Hampf in der Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft

1st Edition 2022

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2022. Overall responsibility for manufacturing (printing and production) lies with Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

For my nieces,
and their generation

Contents

Acknowledgements	xiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research interest and question	4
1.2 Layout of the book	8
I Theory	13
2 Agency and structure	15
2.1 Taking a decision	15
2.2 Dissecting structure	20
3 Global Governance	27
3.1 Neoliberal and normative global governance	31
3.2 Critical global governance	38
3.3 Agency in critical global governance	49
4 Power, discourse, and policy-making	53
4.1 Select perspectives on power	54
4.2 Ideational power	57
4.2.1 Discourse in discursive institutionalism	57
4.2.2 Institutions in discursive institutionalism	59
4.2.3 Ideas and ideational power	62

4.3	Additional levels of discourse	69
4.4	The policy-making process	78
II	Methods	89
5	Cases	91
5.1	Selecting cases	92
5.2	Reasons for selecting Germany and Sweden	101
5.2.1	Similarities	101
5.2.2	Differences	106
6	Methods	113
6.1	Source material	113
6.1.1	Gathering of source material	113
6.1.2	Selection of experts	117
6.2	Analysis	120
6.2.1	Expert interviews	120
6.2.2	Primary source material	126
III	Historical and empirical analysis	135
7	Business and Human Rights: Origins, Developments, Instruments	137
7.1	Corporate Social Responsibility	140
7.1.1	CSR in the 20th century	140
7.1.2	CSR since the 2000s	146
7.2	Business and Human Rights prior to the UN Guiding Principles	161
7.2.1	The Global Compact	161
7.2.2	The Norms	168
7.3	UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights	175
7.3.1	Development of the UN Framework, 2005 to 2008	175

7.3.2	Operationalisation of the UN Framework, 2008 to 2011	180
7.4	Other governance tools and the UNGPs	193
7.4.1	OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises	193
7.4.2	ISO 26000	197
7.4.3	SA8000	201
7.4.4	GRI Standards	204
7.4.5	Global Framework Agreements	207
7.5	European Union	211
7.5.1	National Action Plans on Business and Human Rights	216
7.5.2	Business and Human Rights legislation in select countries	225
8	The Swedish National Action Plan	235
8.1	Development and consultation	236
8.1.1	The question of legal bindingness	239
8.1.2	Joint demand for clarity	246
8.1.3	Vulnerable groups	253
8.1.4	Release and reactions	255
8.2	Implementation	258
8.2.1	The NAP in its policy context	258
8.2.2	The NAP and Corporate Social Responsibility	263
8.3	Subsequent processes	271
8.3.1	Follow-up NAP: the question of legal bindingness revisited	274
8.3.2	National Baseline Assessment	280
8.4	Further developments in 2019 and 2020	285
8.5	Summary	291
9	The German National Action Plan	295
9.1	Development and consultation	300
9.1.1	Plenary sessions	302
9.1.2	The question of legal bindingness	309

9.2	Drafting	322
9.2.1	The ministerial discourse	322
9.2.2	Release and reactions	331
9.3	Implementation	339
9.3.1	The NAP and Corporate Social Responsibility	339
9.3.2	2017: cooperation between IMA and AG	344
9.3.3	2018: designing the monitoring	346
9.4	Monitoring	353
9.4.1	2019: first representative phase	355
9.4.2	2020: second representative phase	359
9.4.3	2021: due diligence legislation	364
9.5	Summary	367
10	Parallel developments in global BHR governance	371
10.1	UN process to develop a legally binding instrument	371
10.1.1	UNHRC resolution 26/9 and reactions	371
10.1.2	Domestic receptions of the LBI process	378
10.2	European Union revisited	390
10.2.1	An ambiguous stance	390
10.2.2	Recent developments	393
11	Conclusion	399
11.1	Discussion of case studies	399
11.2	NAPs in the Global Governance of Business and Human Rights	413
	Appendix	427
	List of Acronyms	429
	List of Tables and Figures	435

Contents	xi
List of Interviews	437
Interview guide	439
Bibliography	441

Acknowledgements

This book is the revised version of my doctoral dissertation with the same name that I submitted to the University of Kassel in July 2021. I wrote it as a member of the *Promotionskolleg Soziale Menschenrechte*, a doctoral school on social human rights jointly organised with the Fulda University of Applied Sciences. A number of people have influenced this work in ways big and small.

First and foremost, my sincerest gratitude is due to my first supervisor Hans-Wolfgang Platzer. Without his advice, guidance, and patience, this book would not have become what it is today. Even though the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic has profoundly changed the ways of our interaction, his support and availability remained the same. Thanks are also due to my second supervisor Christoph Scherrer who always knew to ask the right questions at the right time. I am also grateful to him for publishing this book as part of the *Labor and Globalization* series. Beyond my formal supervisors, I am deeply indebted to Janne Mende who, besides serving on my doctoral committee, has shared and discussed insights on research methods with me and has often provided encouragement. On top of that, she has played an essential role in bringing the above-mentioned *Promotionskolleg* into existence. Furthermore, I am grateful to Daniel Kinderman who agreed to serve on my doctoral committee after little more than a request via email. We have yet to meet in person. All four of the above have provided valuable feedback to my dissertation that I defended on 17 November 2021 at the *International Center for Development and Decent Work* in Kassel.

Apart from my doctoral committee, other people have helped this project come to fruition in various ways. Most obviously, I wholeheartedly thank the numerous experts in

both Sweden and Germany who have invested their time and memory into this project. Their willingness to make themselves available for interviews has made the empirical foundation of this work so much richer. Moreover, I thank Olli Herranen and Frank Fischer for insights on and discussions of the work of Vivien A. Schmidt, and I thank Simone Kreher for offering advice on expert interviews. For providing me with various opportunities to teach at Fulda University of Applied Sciences and try out different teaching formats, I thank Edith Bauer, Matthias Klemm, and Stamatia Devetzi. Teaching has offered a welcome change from mostly solitary research work.

Floris Biskamp and Sarah Schulz, successive coordinators of the *Promotionskolleg*, have always been helpful through any administrative processes, for which I am very grateful. I thank my fellow members of the *Promotionskolleg* for many discussions over the years and invaluable peer support. The same applies to fellow doctoral students of the *Fulda Graduate Centre of Social Sciences* which, though I was never officially part of it, welcomed me to its premises. Among its students I am particularly indebted to David Muñiz-Hernández and Aileen Heid. Their company was especially valuable during the final stretches of 2020 and 2021 that were impacted by the ongoing pandemic. Both have become dear friends.

Almost last but never least, I thank my family for their unflinching support, whether they were always on top of what I was doing or not. Finally, I express my deepest gratitude to my partner Sanni for her companionship, constant support, and encouragement. I am delighted that you all can now hold this final result in your hands.

Yannick Poullie

Tampere, January 2022