



Nizar Shbikat

Labor Rights Violation in Global Supply Chains

A Multi-Stakeholder Approach



Nomos

Edition
Rainer
Hampp



Labor and Globalization
Edited by Prof. Dr. Christoph Scherrer

Volume 23

Nizar Shbikat

Labor Rights Violation in Global Supply Chains

A Multi-Stakeholder Approach



Nomos

Edition
Rainer
Hampp

Coverpicture: © 2021 Nizar Shbikat

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Kassel, Univ., Diss., 2021

ISBN 978-3-98542-011-7 (Print)
978-3-95710-298-0 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-98542-011-7 (Print)
978-3-95710-298-0 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Shbikat, Nizar

Labor Rights Violation in Global Supply Chains

A Multi-Stakeholder Approach

Nizar Shbikat

202 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-98542-011-7 (Print)
978-3-95710-298-0 (ePDF)



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary

Edition Rainer Hampp in der Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft

1st Edition 2021

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2021. Overall responsibility for manufacturing (printing and production) lies with Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

Dedication

*To my beloved parents **Khadeejah and Fayez***

Thanks for your love, support, prayers, encouragement, and sacrifices throughout my life.

*To my precious and wonderful wife **Hiba***

Thank you for being with me during the tough times.

*To my two little angels **Fayez and Mohammad***

Thanks for your interruptions, which have given me the insistence to complete this research.

To all workers who are struggling for their rights

Acknowledgment

First and foremost, I thank Almighty GOD, the Most Compassionate, the Most Merciful, who helped me to complete my thesis.

I would like to thank my supervisor, Prof. Dorit Schumann, for her assistance, encouragement, and guidance since the beginning of this thesis. I also thank her for facilitating my stay in Germany. I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor Prof. Christoph Scherrer for allowing me to be one of his students. It is whole-heartedly appreciated that his great advice for my research proved monumental towards the success of this thesis. I appreciate his patience, advice, encouragement, assistance, and efforts in facilitating the admission process at the School of Social Science.

I wish to show my gratitude to the committee members of the Social Human Rights Graduate School for their respect, advice, and support.

I am indebted to my friend Prof. Boris Zimmermann from Hochschule Fulda, who made life easy for my family and me during our stay in Germany.

The acknowledgment would be incomplete if I do not express my gratitude to the following:

- Britta Kaeler from German Jordanian University
- The Jordanian Ministry of Labor
- The academics and experts participated in the Delphi study
- Better Work Jordan team
- The president of the General Trade Union of Workers In Textile Garment & Clothing Industries in Jordan
- Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung (FES) office in Amman
- Dr. Sarah Schultz, the coordinator of Social Human Rights research group

I thank everyone who has supported me during my Ph.D. journey.

I gratefully acknowledge the scholarships granted by Fulda University and German Jordanian University.

This research is a part of the interdisciplinary research group “Social Human Rights” which is a cooperative program between universities of Kassel and Fulda in Germany.

Publications

1. Shbikat N. (2019) 'Identifying the Root Causes of Human Rights Violation for Workers in International Supply Chains: A Systematic Literature Review'. In: Farache F., Grigore G., Stancu A., McQueen D. (eds.) *Responsible People. Palgrave Studies in Governance, Leadership and Responsibility*. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.
2. Shbikat N. (2020) 'Social Upgrading in Global Garment Supply Chains: Institutional and Principal-Agent Perspectives'. In: Vestena C., Druschel J., Goldbach N., Paulmann F. (eds.) *Interdisziplinäre Perspektiven auf Soziale Menschenrechte*. Nomos Verlag.

Table of Contents

Dedication	5
Acknowledgment.....	7
Publications.....	8
Table of Contents.....	9
List of Figures.....	12
List of Tables.....	13
List of Abbreviations.....	14
Hardware and Software Specifications.....	16
Chapter One: Introduction.....	17
1.1 Problem statement.....	17
1.2 Research structure and questions	17
Chapter Two: Literature Review.....	22
2.1 International supply chains.....	22
2.2 Social sustainability.....	24
2.3 Labor rights in global business.....	27
2.4 Social upgrading	29
2.5 Global labor governance	30
Chapter Three: Theoretical Framework.....	32
3.1 Stakeholder theory.....	32
3.2 Power resources approach (PRA)	35
3.3 Principal-agent theory (agency theory)	38
3.4 Neo-institutional theory	40
Chapter Four: Identifying the Root Causes of Labor Rights Violations in Global Supply Chains: A Systematic Literature Review	44
4.1 Introduction	44
4.2 Labor status in international supply chains	44
4.3 Labor governance: a “wicked problem”	45
4.4 Methodology	46
4.4.1 Question formulation.....	46
4.4.2 Search protocol.....	47
4.4.3 Analysis and synthesis	49

4.5 Results	49
4.5.1 Contribution by countries	49
4.5.2 Publication year analysis	50
4.5.3 Distribution by journals.....	51
4.5.4 Labor rights violation by industry	52
4.5.5 Research methods and topics	53
4.5.6 Cause-and-effect analysis	54
4.6. Discussion.....	69
4.7. Summary.....	73
Chapter Five: Assessment of Labor Rights Violation in Global Supply Chains	75
5.1. Introduction	75
5.2 Business and human rights measurement	76
5.3 Assessment methods by NGOs and ESG rating agencies	79
5.3.1 Global Reporting Initiative.....	80
5.3.2 Behind the Brands	81
5.3.3 RobecoSAM's Corporate Sustainability Assessment (CSA).....	83
5.3.4 Refinitiv ESG Score	85
5.4 Social auditing.....	86
5.5 Composite index approach to measure social sustainability.....	90
5.6 A proposed worker participatory framework to measure labor rights violation.....	93
5.6.1 Identification of labor rights indicators.....	94
5.6.2 Formulating indicators	94
5.6.3 Weights assignment	104
5.6.4 Aggregation of indicators	105
5.7 Illustrative example	107
5.8 Summary.....	115
Chapter Six: Social Upgrading in Global Supply Chains: Multi-actors Power Analysis.....	116
6.1 Introduction	116
6.2 Defining the power resources of actors in supply chains	117
6.2.1 Legitimate authority of the state.....	117
6.2.2 Inter-organizational relationship.....	118

6.2.3 Consumer power	121
6.2.4 Supplier power over workers	122
6.2.5 Media power	122
6.2.6 Other actors	123
6.3 Power analysis in global supply chains	123
6.3.1 The case of Xintang Jeans Town.....	130
6.3.2 The case of Bangladeshi Accord	133
6.4 Summary.....	140
Chapter Seven: Social Upgrading in Global Garment Supply Chains: Institutional and Principal-Agent Perspectives	142
7.1 Introduction	142
7.2 Better Work Jordan	143
7.3 Methodology	148
7.4 ILO as an institutional entrepreneur	149
7.4.1 Institutional work	150
7.4.2 Union perspective	164
7.5 ILO as a facilitator for solving principal-agent problem	166
7.5.1 Buyers perspective	166
7.5.2 Suppliers perspective	170
7.6 Discussion.....	172
7.7 Summary.....	174
Chapter 8: Conclusion.....	176
8.1 Review of the research questions	176
8.2 Recommendations for future research	180
8.3 Implications	181
References	182

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: The three stages of examining labor rights violation	18
Figure 2.1: The three elements of sustainability	24
Figure 4.1: Steps of conducting a systematic literature review	46
Figure 4.2: Contribution by countries	50
Figure 4.3: Chronological distribution of the reviewed articles	50
Figure 4.4: Industry-specific analysis	53
Figure 4.5: Fishbone diagram	64
Figure 4.6: Cause-and-effect analysis for workers	64
Figure 4.7: Cause-and-effect analysis for MNC	65
Figure 4.8: Cause-and-effect analysis for suppliers	66
Figure 4.9: Cause-and-effect analysis for host authority	67
Figure 4.10: Cause-and-effect analysis for unions	67
Figure 4.11: Cause-and-effect analysis for other stakeholders	68
Figure 5.1: Criteria weighting approach adopted by Behind the Brand	81
Figure 5.2: Benchmark of ten global food and beverage companies according to Behind the Brands scoring method	82
Figure 5.3: RobecoSAM's approach to measure corporate sustainability	84
Figure 5.4: Refintiv's methodology to measure ESG index for companies	85
Figure 5.5: Human rights as a part of sustainability	91
Figure 5.6: Index construction methodology	94
Figure 5.7: Calculation of worker's rating	95
Figure 5.8: Observer-experencer matrix	97
Figure 5.9: Benchmark of the three companies according to dimension indices	113
Figure 5.10: Benchmark of the three factories according to LRV index	113
Figure 5.11: Experencer-observer matrix assessing sexual harassment at the factory one	114
Figure 6.1: Supplier-Customer Power Matrix	120
Figure 6.2: Actors Interaction Map - The Case of Sun Yi before media coverage	124
Figure 6.3: Actors Interaction Map - The Case of Sun Yi after media coverage	125
Figure 6.4: Actors Interaction Map - The Case of Xintang (Competition View)	130
Figure 6.5: Actors Interaction Map - The Case of Xintang (Co-opetition View)	131
Figure 6.6: Actors Interaction Map - before Accord	137
Figure 6.7: Actors Interaction Map - the case of Accord	138
Figure 7.1: Yearly Worldwide Export Value of RMG (Jordan)	143
Figure 7.2: Analysis of non-compliance percentage among participating garment factories	146
Figure 7.3: The institutional changes timeline for the Jordanian garment sector since 2008	150
Figure 7.4: Selected workers' drawings from factory one	159
Figure 7.5: BWJ as a facilitator in principal-agent relationship	166

List of Tables

Table 1.1: Research structure	19
Table 3.1: The three elements of institutions	41
Table 3.2: A comparison between the agency and neo-institutional theories	43
Table 4.1: Identification of search strings	47
Table 4.2: Meta-search results	48
Table 4.3: Journals with relevant publications on labor rights in supply chains	51
Table 4.4: The topics covered by the reviewed articles	54
Table 4.5: Possible causes of labor rights violation in international supply chains	55
Table 5.1: Assessment methods by NGOs and ESG rating agencies	80
Table 5.2: Three commitment levels to social auditing adopted by companies	87
Table 5.3: The possible outcomes of the observer	96
Table 5.4: The definition of LRV dimensions and indicators	98
Table 5.5: Participants of the Delphi study	108
Table 5.6: Optimization of weights using Genetic Algorithm	109
Table 6.1: Actors power resources	128
Table 7.1: Comparison of BWJ with other labor governance mechanisms	144
Table 7.2: Comparative analysis of BWJ impact across five countries	147
Table 7.3: The three main QIZs in Jordan	148
Table 7.4: An overview of the participating factories	148
Table 7.5: Highlights of the CBAs assigned in the garment sector	150
Table 7.6: Forms of institutional work by BWJ	151
Table 7.7: The union activities in the period January-December 2019	165
Table 7.8: Vision, mission, and strategies of BWJ	174

List of Abbreviations

ABDX	Administration and Board of Directors of Xintang International Jeans and Texture City
AHP	Analytic Hierarchy Process
AIM	Actors Interaction Map
BAP	Budget Allocation Process
BWJ	Better Work Jordan
CBA	Collective Bargaining Agreement
CCC	Clean Clothes Campaign
CIMO	Context, Intervention, Mechanism, Output
COC	Code of Conduct
CPI	Complex Performance Indicator
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
DEA	Data Envelopment Analysis
DMAIC	Define, Measure, Analyze, Improve and Control
EDI	Electronic Data Interchange
EICC	Electronic Industry Code of Conduct
EPI	Environmental Pressure Indicators
EPZs	Export Processing Zones
ESG IPAs	Environmental, Social and Governance Rating, and Information Provider Agencies
EU	European Union
FES	Friedrich-Elbert Foundation
FLA	Fair Labor Association
GA	Genetic Algorithm
GIZ	German Development Agency
GRI	Global Reporting Initiative
GTUWTGCI	General Trade Union of Workers in Textile, Garment & Clothing Industries
GUF	Global Union Federation
HR	Human Resource
ICTs	Information and Communication Technologies
IFA	International Framework Agreement
IFC	International Finance Corporation
ILO	International Labor Organization
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Nature
JGATE	Jordan Garment and Textiles Exporters Association
JIT	Just-In-Time
LLCS	Low-Cost Country Sourcing
LVRI	Labor Rights Violation Index
MCDM	Multicriteria Decision Making
MNC	Multinational Corporation
MOL	Jordanian Ministry of Labor
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MSI	Multi-Stakeholder Initiative
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization

NLC	National Labor Committee
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OSH	Occupational Health and Safety
PAC	Project Advisory Committee
PCA	Principal Component Analysis
PPRA	Power Resources Approach
PWC	PricewaterhouseCoopers
QIZs	Qualified Industrial Zones
QR	Quick Response
RMG	Readymade Garment
SAI	Social Accountability International
SAW	Simple Additive Weighting
SC	Steering Committee
SCM	Supply Chain Management
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SEZs	Special Economic Zones
SMOs	Social Movements Organizations
SST	Supervisory Skills Training
STM	The International Association of Scientific, Technical and Medical Publishers
TBL	Triple Bottom Line
TNC	Transnational Corporation
TNW	Total Number of Workers
TVPRA	Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act
UAW	United Automobile Workers
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
WRC	Worker Rights Consortium
WTO	World Trade Organization

Hardware and Software Specifications

This section lists the technical specifications of the hardware, software, and online platforms used to facilitate the completion of the thesis.

	Application	Chapter
Hardware		
Laptop: Surface Book (Core i5, 8 GB RAM, 128 GB Drive)	Facilitating data processing and management during the dissertation.	All
Audio Recorder: ZOOM H1	Recording interviews	7
Software		
Microsoft Office 360 ProPlus	Dissertation writing, data analysis (calculations of Kendall's Coefficient of Concordance, Genetic Algorithm [Solver], and Monte Carlo simulation), Visualization (Fishbone Diagrams [Visio], Actors Interaction Maps [Word])	All
IBM SPSS Statistics Ver. 24	Calculations of Kendall's Coefficient of Concordance	5
Subtitle Workshop Ver. 2.51	Interviews transcription	7
Mendeley Ver. 1.19.4	Reference management	All
Online Platforms		
SoSciSurvey.de	Conducting an online survey	5
Grammarly	Proofreading and spelling check	All
Google Drive	Data backup	All