

Nora Schrader-Rashidkhan

Rebel Parties in African Post-Conflict Elections

Explaining Party Formation and Success



Nomos

**Comparative Politics –
Vergleichende Politikwissenschaft**

edited by

Prof. Dr. Susanne Pickel, University of Duisburg-Essen

Prof. Dr. Christof Hartmann, University of Duisburg-Essen

Prof. Ingo Rohlfing, PhD, University of Cologne

Volume 10

Nora Schrader-Rashidkhan

Rebel Parties in African Post-Conflict Elections

Explaining Party Formation and Success



Nomos

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Duisburg-Essen, Univ., Diss., 2020

ISBN 978-3-8487-7084-7 (Print)
978-3-7489-2474-6 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-7084-7 (Print)
978-3-7489-2474-6 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Schrader-Rashidkhan, Nora
Rebel Parties in African Post-Conflict Elections
Explaining Party Formation and Success
Nora Schrader-Rashidkhan
426 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-7084-7 (Print)
978-3-7489-2474-6 (ePDF)



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary

1st Edition 2021

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2021. Overall responsibility for manufacturing (printing and production) lies with Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

To Emanuel and Minou

Abstract

In many post-conflict countries around the globe, former rebel groups participate in elections as newly formed political parties ('rebel parties'). This thesis deals with rebel party development in Sub-Saharan Africa and asks precisely if institutional context factors shape paths towards rebel party participation and success in post-conflict elections in this region. Motivated by serious gaps in literature, the thesis develops a new research framework for the comparative analysis of rebel party formation and success by bringing together conflict-oriented research addressing 'rebel-to-party transformation' and general political party literature with a focus on institutionalist perspectives. An original approach is presented that integrates theoretical arguments from various sources to provide a solid basis for a more systematic data collection that covers all African cases of actual electoral participation, and to deduce variables that are suspect of structuring certain opportunities for rebel party development. New theoretical arguments are then empirically tested with several configurational analyses by using fsQCA. The results prove that inter alia the institutionalization of power after military victory is a main explanation for rebel party success, while weaker groups benefit from inclusionary peace agreements that stimulate party formation. A second contribution is the confirmation of serious path dependencies that unfold with the consolidation of rebel party dominance after first elections, so that second elections are won as well. For disarmament provisions and formation costs, the analysis however suggests counter-intuitive effects. In the end, the volume proves that the processes of rebel party formation and success in Africa follow certain patterns and respond to institutional structures, and that they also tend to reproduce typical patterns of African party competition in general.

Acknowledgements

This book has been a very long journey. First of all, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my advisor Professor Christof Hartmann for his strong support during my whole PhD process. Without his education, commitment, advice and patience, this project would not exist. I am also indebted to PD Dr Daniel Lambach, who kindly agreed to be my second supervisor, and whose rigorous examination was very helpful for preparing this publication. I would also like to thank the editors, Professor Christof Hartmann, Professor Susanne Pickel and Professor Ingo Rohlfing, for suggesting and supporting my publication within this series. At the Institute of Political Science and the Faculty of Social Science at University Duisburg-Essen, I enjoyed a very reliable environment to develop my research, which I highly appreciate. On a personal level, I am deeply grateful to my parents and my brother, who always believed in my ambitions and who supported me with reassurance and hours of childcare. Both was tremendously helpful to finalize this project. Finally, my gratitude goes to Mohsen, who gave me strength with his confidence, love, and regular lunch breaks, and to my children, whose gentle but determined distraction helped me to remain a content and balanced person throughout my PhD process. This is for them.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	9
Abbreviations	19
1. Introduction	27
1.1 Outline of the argumentation	28
1.2 Rebel Group ‘Transformation’: Literature Review and Critique	33
1.2.1 ‘Transformation’ as a Concept for Rebel Group Adaptation After Conflict	35
1.2.2 Critique: Shortcomings of the Transformation Debate	46
2. Rebel Groups and Post-Conflict Elections in Wider Theoretical Perspective	54
2.1 Setting the Stage: Democratization and Peacebuilding in Africa	54
2.2 Political Parties and Rebel Groups: Concepts, Limits and Nexuses	59
2.2.1 Defining ‘Political Parties’ and ‘Rebel Parties’	59
2.2.2 Defining ‘Rebel Groups’	64
2.2.3 Terrorism and Political Parties: Limits of a related topic	70
2.3 Political Parties in Post-Conflict and African Societies	74
2.3.1 Political Parties in Post-Conflict and Transitional Democracies	74
2.3.2 Political Parties in Sub-Saharan Africa	78
3. Rebel Groups’ Electoral Participation in Africa: Research Design and Methodological Issues	84
3.1 Relevant Guidelines from Party Research	84
3.1.1 New Party Formation and Success, Breakthrough and Persistence	85
3.1.2 Cornerstones of Institutional Analysis in Party Research	92

Table of Contents

3.2 Violent Conflicts and Democratic Elections in Methodological Perspective	96
3.2.1 Armed Conflicts as a Precondition for Rebel Party Emergence	96
3.2.2 ‘Democratic’ Post-Conflict Elections as a Second Precondition	99
3.3 Systematizing Rebel Party Analysis	103
3.4 Qualitative Comparative Analysis: Introducing the Method	105
4. Rebel Groups in Elections: A Data Set	110
5. Conditions for Rebel Groups’ Party Formation and Party Success in African Post-Conflict Elections	119
5.1 Institutions and their Effect on Political Party Development in Post-Conflict Societies	119
5.2 Institutional Factors and their Influence on Party Formation	126
5.2.1 General Institutional Conditions for Party Formation	127
5.2.1.1 The Electoral Focus: Presidentialism versus Parliamentarism	128
5.2.1.2 Federalism and Decentralization	131
5.2.1.3 Electoral System	133
5.2.1.4 Formation Costs	139
5.2.2 Party Formation in the Light of Conflict	145
5.2.2.1 War legacies	147
5.2.2.2 War to peace transition	149
5.2.2.3 Post War Environment	163
5.2.3 Consolidated Framework for Rebel Party Formation	175
5.3 Institutional Factors and their Influence on Party Performance	179
5.3.1 Institutions Affecting New Party Performance	181
5.3.1.1 Electoral Systems	185
5.3.1.2 Regime Type, Presidentialism and the Timing of Elections	193
5.3.2 Institutions Affecting Newer Party Persistence	198
5.3.2.1 Institutionalization and Types of Party Systems	199
5.3.3 Conflict-Related Conditions for Initial and Persistent Rebel Party Success	205
5.3.3.1 The Regime Type and Legacies of Rebellion	206

5.3.3.2	The Reflection of Regional Disparities by the Electoral System	210
5.3.3.3	The Salience of Wartime Cleavages and Political Space	213
5.3.4	Consolidated Framework for Initial and Persistent Rebel Party Success	220
6.	Conditions for Rebel Party Formation, Success and Persistence: Applying fsQCA and Discussing Results	226
6.1	Rebel Party Formation	228
6.1.1	Calibration and Coding of General Conditions for Rebel Party Formation	230
6.1.1.1	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Rebel Victory	230
6.1.1.2	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Peace Agreement	233
6.1.1.3	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Formation Costs and Party Bans	235
6.1.1.4	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Fair Interim Regimes and Electoral Management	238
6.1.2	fsQCA for Rebel Party Formation (General Conditions)	241
6.1.3	Calibration and Coding of Conditions for Rebel Party Formation After Peace Agreements	251
6.1.3.1	Components of Peace Agreements: Inclusive Power-Sharing	252
6.1.3.2	Components of Peace Agreements: Disarmament	254
6.1.3.3	Components of Peace Agreements: Permissive Electoral Participation Provisions	255
6.1.4	fsQCA for Rebel Party Formation after Peace Agreements	256
6.1.5	Findings for Rebel Party Formation	267
6.2	Rebel Party Success	269
6.2.1	Calibration and Coding of Conditions and Outcome for Initial Rebel Party Success	270
6.2.1.1	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Electoral System Effects	273
6.2.1.2	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Candidature for Head of Government	276
6.2.1.3	Calibration and Coding of Conditions: Favourable Political Space	279

Table of Contents

6.2.2	fsQCA for Initial Rebel Party Success	282
6.2.3	Calibration and Coding of Conditions and Outcome for Persistent Rebel Party Success	290
6.2.3.1	Calibration and Coding of Conditions: Electoral System Effects	295
6.2.3.2	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Democratic Fairness of Second Election	296
6.2.3.3	Calibration and Coding of Condition: Party Dominance	298
6.2.4	fsQCA for Persistent Rebel Party Success	299
6.2.5	Findings for Rebel Party Success	307
7.	Conclusion	311
	Bibliography	325
	Appendix A	383
	Appendix B	405

List of Figures

Figure 1: The universes of cases	91
Figure 2: Research Design	104
Figure 3: The Process of Rebel Party Formation as mediated by Electoral Institutions	178
Figure 4: The Dynamic of Rebel Party Breakthrough	224
Figure 5: The Dynamic of Rebel Party Persistence	225
Figure 6: Truth Table for Rebel Party Formation (Complex Solution)	245
Figure 7: Truth Table for Rebel Party Formation (Parsimonious Solution)	246
Figure 8: Truth Table for the Non-Formation of Rebel Parties (Complex solution)	249
Figure 9: Truth Table for the Non-Formation of Rebel Parties (Parsimonious solution)	250
Figure 10: Truth Table for Rebel Party Formation after Peace Agreements (Complex Solution)	260
Figure 11: Truth Table for Rebel Party Formation after Peace Agreements (Parsimonious Solution)	261
Figure 12: x-y plot for DISARM \leftarrow outcome	262
Figure 13: Truth Table for the Non-Formation of Rebel Parties After Peace Agreements (Complex Solution)	265
Figure 14: Truth Table for the Non-Formation of Rebel Parties After Peace Agreements (Parsimonious Solution)	266

List of Figures

Figure 15: x-y Plot for Solution LOW_THR*CANDIT*POL_SP	284
Figure 16: Truth Table for Initial Rebel Party Success (Complex and Parsimonious Solution)	286
Figure 17: Truth Table for Non-Success of Rebel Parties (Complex Solution)	288
Figure 18: Truth Table for Non-Success of Rebel Parties (Parsimonious Solution)	289
Figure 19: Truth Table for Persistent Rebel Party Success (Complex Solution)	302
Figure 20: Truth Table for Persistent Rebel Party Success (Parsimonious Solution)	303
Figure 21: x-y plot for \sim PAR_DOM \leftarrow \sim outcome	304
Figure 22: Truth Table for Absence of Party Persistence (Complex Solution)	306
Figure 23: Truth Table for Absence of Party Persistence (Parsimonious Solution)	307

List of Tables

Table 1:	Overview of African States and Violent Conflicts (1989-2014)	111
Table 2:	Overview of African Rebel Groups Included	112
Table 3:	Consolidated list of Rebel Group's Electoral Participation in Africa	114
Table 4:	Framework for analysing rebel party formation	177
Table 5:	Framework for analysing rebel party performance (breakthrough)	223
Table 6:	Framework for analysing rebel party performance (persistence)	224
Table 7:	Coding of Outcome: Rebel Party Formation	229
Table 8:	War Termination in African civil Wars (1989-2014)	232
Table 9:	Peace Agreements in African civil Wars (1989-2014)	234
Table 10:	Barriers to Parties and Party Bans (Low Formation Costs)	237
Table 11:	Fair Interim Regimes and EMB Autonomy	241
Table 12:	Raw Data Matrix for Rebel Party Formation	241
Table 13:	Overview of Elections After Implemented Peace Agreements	251
Table 14:	Power-Sharing in Implemented Peace Agreements Prior to Elections	253

List of Tables

Table 15: Disarmament Provisions in Implemented Peace Agreements	255
Table 16: Electoral Participation Provisions in Implemented Peace Agreements	256
Table 17: Raw Data Matrix for Rebel Party Formation after Peace Agreements	257
Table 18: Necessary Conditions for the Absence of Party Formation	262
Table 19: Electoral Results of Rebel Parties in First Post-conflict Elections	271
Table 20: Membership in Set ‘Rebel Party Success’	272
Table 21: Low Thresholds of Representation	276
Table 22: Candidatures for Head of Government	279
Table 23: Favourable Political Space	282
Table 24: Raw Data Matrix for Initial Rebel Party Success	283
Table 25: Rebel Party Persistence in Second Elections	293
Table 26: Membership in Set ‘Persistent Party Success’	293
Table 27: Low Thresholds of Representation in 2nd election	296
Table 28: Democratic Fairness of 2nd Election	297
Table 29: Party Dominance	298
Table 30: Raw Data Matrix for Party Persistence	299

Abbreviations

General abbreviations

Agm	Agreement
CAR	Central African Republic
CATA	Cape Amalgamated Taxi Association
CPA	Comprehensive Peace Agreement
CTD	Conflict Termination Dataset
DDR	Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
EMB	Electoral Management Bodies
fn	footnote
FPTP	First-Past-The-Post
Frw	Framework
fsQCA	Fuzzy-set Qualitative Comparative Analysis
HoR	House of Representatives
ibid.	ibidem
id.	idem
IFES	International Foundation for Electoral Systems
IPU	Inter-Parliamentary Union
MMC	Multi Member Constituency
NC	National Constituency
NSAG	Non-state armed groups
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PA	Peace Agreement
PAD	Peace Agreement Dataset
PBV	Party Bloc Vote
PCE	Post-Conflict Election
PR	Proportional Representation
PRIO	Peace Research Institute Oslo
Prot	Protocoll

Abbreviations

PSED	Power-sharing Event Dataset
QCA	Qualitative Comparative Analysis
RoW	Regimes of the World
SMC	Single Member Constituency
STV	Single Transferable Vote
UCDP	Uppsala Conflict Data Program
UN	United Nations
V-Dem	Varieties of Democracy
VNSA	Violent Non-state Actors

Rebel groups and political parties

ADC	Alliance Démocratique du 23 Mai pour le Changement - Ibrahim Bahanga faction
ADC-Ikibiri	Alliance of Democrats for Change in Burundi
ADF	Alliance of democratic Forces
ADP	Alliance démocratique des peuples
AFDL	Alliance des forces démocratiques pour la libération du Congo
AIAI	Al-Ittihad Al-Islami/Islamic Unity
ALCOP	All Liberia Coalition Party
ALiR	Armes pour la Liberation du Rwanda
ANC	African National Congress
ANDP	Afar National Democratic Party
ATNMC	Alliance Touareg Nord Mali pour le Changement
APCLS	Alliance des patriotes pour un Congo libre et souverain
APRD	Armée Populaire pour la Restauration de la République et la Démocratie
ARD	Alliance Republicaine pour la Démocratie
ARDUF	Afar Revolutionary Democratic Unity Front
AFRC	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council
ARLA	Armée révolutionnaire de libération de l'Azaouad
ATNMC	Alliance Touareg Nord Mali pour le Changement
AWB	Afrikaner Weerstandsbeweging

BDK	Bundu dia Kongo
Boko Haram	Jama'atu Ahlis Sunna Lidda'awati wal-Jihad
CNDD	Conseil National Pour la Défense de la Démocratie
CNDD-FDD	CNDD - Forces pour la Défense de la Démocratie
CNDP	Congrès National pour la Défense du Peuple
CNR	Comité national de redressement
CNR	Conseil National de la Résistance
CNRD	Conseil national pour le renouveau et la démocratie
CODEM	Coordination of the Democratic Opposition
COJEP	Congrès panafricain des jeunes patriotes or Congrès panafricain pour la justice et l'égalité des peuples
CPJP	Convention of Patriots for Justice and Peace
CSNPD	Conseil de salut national pour la paix et la démocratie
EPLF	Eritrean People's Liberation Front
EPRDF	Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front
ESDL	Ethiopian Somali Democratic League
FAPC	Forces armées du Peuple congolais
FARDC	Forces Armées de la République Démocratique du Congo
FARF	Forces armées pour la République fédérale
FDC	Front de la défense du Congo
FDLR	Forces démocratiques de libération du Rwanda
FDR	Front démocratique pour le renouveau
FDSI-CI	Forces de Défense et de Sécurité Impartiales de Côte d'Ivoire
FIAA	Front islamique arabe de l'Azaouad
FLEC-FAC	FLEC - Armed Forces of Cabinda
FLEC-R	Front for the Liberation of the Enclave of Cabinda-Renewal
FMLN	Frente Farabundo Martí para la Liberación Nacional
FN	Forces Nouvelles
FNDIC	Federated Niger Delta Ijaw Communities
FNI	Front des Nationalistes et Intégrationnistes
FNL	Forces nationales de liberation
FNL-LP	FNL-Lovers of Peace Faction
FNT	Front national tchadien
FPI	Front Populaire Ivoirien
FPLA	Front Populaire de Libération de l'Azaouad
FPR	Front patriotique rwandais

Abbreviations

FPRC	The Popular Front for the Rebirth of Central African Republic
FR	Forces du Renouveau
FRCI	Forces Républicaines de Côte d'Ivoire
Frolina	Front de Libération Nationale
FRPI	Force de résistance patriotique d'Ituri
FRUD	Front for the Restoration of Unity and Democracy
FRUD-AD	FRUD - Ahmed Dini faction
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party
IGLF	Issa and Guraga Liberation Front
INPFL	Independent National Patriotic Front of Liberia
JEM	Justice and Equality Movement
LPC	Liberia Peace Council
LRA	Lord's Resistance Arm
LURD	Liberians United for Reconciliation and Democracy
M23	Mouvement du 23-Mars
MAA	Mouvement Arabe de l'Azawad
MAGRIVI	Mutuelle des Agriculteurs de Virunga
MCDDI	Mouvement Congolais pour la démocratie et le développement intégral
MDD	Mouvement pour la démocratie et le développement
MDF	Moorland Defence Forces
MDJT	Mouvement pour la démocratie et la justice au Tchad
MFDC	Mouvement des forces démocratiques de Casamance
MFDC-FN	MFDC-Front Nord
MFDC-FN-MD	MFDC-Front Nord Magne Diémé faction
MFDC-S	MFDC-Salif Sadio faction
MILOCI	Mouvement pour la Libération de l'Ouest de la Côte d'Ivoire
MJP	Mouvement pour la Justice et la Paix
MLC	Mouvement de Libération du Congo
MMM	Mai-Mai Movement
MNJ	Mouvement des Nigériens pour la Justice
MNLA	Mouvement national de libération de l'Azawad
MODEL	Movement for Democracy in Liberia
Mosanat	Mouvement pour la salvation nationale tchadienne
MPA	Mouvement populaire de l'Azaouad

MPA/Rep. of Anjouan	Mouvement populaire anjouanais: Anjouan People's Movement (Comoros)
MPA-SOC	MPA - Said Omar Chamassi faction (Comoros)
MPCI	Mouvement Patriotique de Côte d'Ivoire
MPGK	Mouvement patriotique Ganda Koy
MPIGO	Mouvement Populaire Ivoirien du Grand Ouest
MPS	Mouvement patriotique du salut
MRLZ	Mouvement révolutionnaire pour la libération du Zaïre
MUJAO	Mouvement pour le Tawhîd et du Jihad en Afrique de l'Ouest
NAP	Nouvelle Alliance pour le Progrès
NDA	National Democratic Alliance
NDC	Nduma Defense of Congo
NDPL	National Democratic Party of Liberia
NDPVF	Niger Delta Peoples Volunteer Force
NDV	Niger Delta Vigilante
NPC	National Popular Congress
NPFL	National Patriotic Front of Liberia
NPP	National Patriotic Party
OLF	Oromo Liberation Front
ONLF	Ogaden National Liberation Front
PAC	Pan-Africanist Congress
Palipehutu	Parti pour la libération du peuple Hutu
Palipehutu-FNL-LP	Palipehutu - FNL - Lovers of Peace Faction
PALIR	Peuple en Armes Pour la Liberation du Rwanda
PARECO	Patriotes Résistants Congolais
PARECO-PAP	Coalition des résistants patriotes congolais/Parti du peuple
PCT	Parti Congolais du Travail
PCUD	Central African Party for Unity and Development
PDC	Parti Démocrate Centriste
PDF	Popular Defence Force
PDI	Parti Démocratique Idéal
PDP	People's Democratic Party
POLISARIO	Popular Front for the Liberation of Saguia el Hamra and Rio de Oro
PRM	Patriotes Résistants Maï-Maï
PRODEM	Progressive Democratic Party

Abbreviations

PRP/Kabila	Parti révolution populaire
PSR	Parti Socialiste Rwandais,
PUSIC	Parti pour l'unité et la sauvegarde de l'intégrité du Congo
RCD	Rassemblement Congolais pour la Démocratie
RCD-CP	RCD - Christian Pay Pay faction
RCD-K-ML	RCD - Kisangani/ Forces for Renewal
RCD-LN	RCD - Laurent Nkunda faction
RCD-ML	RCD - Movement for Liberation
RCD-N	RCD - National
RCD-PM	RCD - Patrick Masunzu
RDR	Rassemblement des Républicains
Renamo	Resistência nacional Moçambicana
Renamo-UE	Renamo-União Eleitoral
RFC	Rassemblement des forces pour le changement
RFDG	Rassemblement des Forces démocratiques de Guinée
RPRC	Patriotic Assembly for the Renaissance of Central Africa
RUF	Revolutionary United Front
RUFP	Revolutionary United Front Party
SLDF	Sabaot Land Defence Force
SLM/A	Sudan Liberation Movement/Army
SLM/A-MM	SLM/A-Minni Minawi faction
SLM/A-Unity	SLM/A-Unity
SLPP	Sierra Leone People's Party
SPDP	Somali People's Democratic Party
SPDP	Somali People's Democratic Party
SPLM/A	Sudan People's Liberation Movement/Army
SPLM/A-WN	SPLM/A-William Nyuon faction
SSDF	South Sudan Defence Force
SSUM/A	South Sudan Unity Movement/Army
SWAPO	South West African People's Organisation
UAD	Union pour l'alternance démocratique
UDPR	Union Démocratique du Peuple Rwandais
UDPS-Amana	Union pour la Démocratie et le Progrès Social - Amana
UDT	Union démocratique tchadienne
UFDD	Union of Forces for Democracy and Development

Abbreviations

UFDD-F	UFDD-Fondamentale
UFDR	Union des Forces Démocratiques pour le Rassemblement
UFR	Union of Resistance Forces
UFRA	Union des Forces de la résistance armée
ULIMO	United Liberation Movement for Democracy in Liberia
ULIMO-J	ULIMO Roosevelt Johnson faction
ULIMO-K	ULIMO Alhaji Kromah faction
UNITA	União Nacional para Independência Total de Angola
UMP	Union pour la Majorité Présidentielle
UPA	Uganda People's Army
UPADS	Union panafricaine pour la démocratie sociale
UPC	Union des Patriotes congolais
UPC	Union for Peace in the Central African Republic (CAR)
URDC/AFPC	Union de Résistance Démocratique Congolais / Alliance des forces populaires et Patriotiques du Congo
WNBF	West Nile Bank Front
WSB	West Side Boys
ZANU-PF	Zimbabwe African National Union - Patriotic Front

