

Ilka Roose

# Flows of Chilean Water Governance

Social Innovations in Defiance of *Mistrust*  
and Fragmented Institutions



Nomos

## Sustainable Development in the 21st Century

Editor

Andreas Rechkemmer, Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Doha

Editorial Board

Kevin Collins, The Open University, Milton Keynes

Sven Bernhard Gareis, WWU Münster

Edgar Grande, WZB Berlin Social Science Center

Hartmut Ihne, Hochschule Bonn-Rhein-Sieg

Maria Ivanova, University of Massachusetts Boston

Uwe Schneidewind, Wuppertal Institute

Wilhelm Vossenkuhl, Ludwig Maximilians University of Munich

Volume 4

Ilka Roose

# Flows of Chilean Water Governance

Social Innovations in Defiance of Mistrust  
and Fragmented Institutions



**Nomos**

Erstgutachter: Prof. Dr. Dirk Messner  
Zweitgutachter: Prof. Dr. Uwe Schneidewind  
Tag der Disputation: 28.11.2019

Diese Arbeit wurde vom Fachbereich Gesellschaftswissenschaften der Universität Duisburg-Essen als Dissertation zur Erlangung des Doktorgrades (Dr. rer. pol.) genehmigt.

© Coverpicture: NASA Earth Observatory image by Joshua Stevens, using MODIS data from the Land Atmosphere Near real-time Capability for EOS (LANCE). Caption by Kathryn Hansen.

**The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Duisburg/Essen, Univ., Diss., 2019

ISBN 978-3-8487-6930-8 (Print)  
978-3-7489-1019-0 (ePDF)

#### **British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-6930-8 (Print)  
978-3-7489-1019-0 (ePDF)

#### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Roose, Ilka

Flows of Chilean Water Governance

Social Innovations in Defiance of Mistrust and Fragmented Institutions

Ilka Roose

259 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-6930-8 (Print)  
978-3-7489-1019-0 (ePDF)



Onlineversion  
Nomos eLibrary

1. Edition 2020

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2020. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

## Acknowledgments

This study was accepted as a dissertation in political sciences at the University of Duisburg-Essen (UDE) in the winter semester of 2019/20. I would like to thank the editors of the series »Sustainable Development in the 21st Century« for accepting the study and in particular Prof. Dr. Andreas Rechkemmer and Nomos for the good collaboration.

Throughout the writing of this dissertation I have received great support and assistance. Firstly, I would like to express my deep gratitude to Professor Dr. Dirk Messner and Professor Dr. Uwe Schneidewind, my research supervisors, for their patient guidance, encouragement and useful critique of this research work. Special thanks go out to Dr. Alex Godoy. It is owing to his extraordinary professional and personal qualities that I received the best mentoring I could wish for during my field stays in Chile. Furthermore, I deeply appreciate the professional and kind conversations with Dr. Annabelle Houdret.

This dissertation has benefited from the lively exchange of ideas with many friends and colleagues affiliated to the ARUS program at the UDE. I would like to thank all the members of the program for their fruitful advice and support. In particular, I would like to thank Dr. Elke Hochmuth, Professor Dr. Alexander J. Schmidt and PD Dr. Ani Melkonyan.

Moreover, I would like to thank the German Federal Enterprise for Academic Exchange Service (DAAD) and the Heinrich Böll Foundation for supporting this work with financial and ideological scholarships. Especially, I appreciate the enriching conversations with the head of the Heinrich Böll Office in Chile, Dr. Ingrid Wehr.

This study is based on many field visits that would not have been as fruitful without the generous support of many institutions and scholars in Chile. Firstly, I would like to thank the Universidad de Desarrollo for its trust. Moreover, I would like to thank the Pontificia Univerdad Católica de Valparaíso and in particular the members of the Programa de Gestión Hídrica, Professor Eduardo Salgado, Nieggiiorba Livellara, Marcela Sotomayor, Virginia Bravo, Carolina Olivares, Fernando Varas, and Viviana Álvarez, for their patience and assistance to my many questions and for making me feel like a member of their team. Likewise, I would like to thank the members of Ecosistemas, Juan Pablo Orrego, Mitzi Urtubia, Paulina Jineo and Patricia Salgado.

*Acknowledgments*

Without the warmest hospitality and friendship of the family Ardiles Vilches, I would not have been able to conduct this study. Moreover, I would also like to extend my thanks to Mario and Haydee, Terry and Eduardo for their generosity and encouragement.

Most importantly, I am very thankful to all my interview partners for opening their doors and minds to me and for sharing their precious time. I am deeply grateful for the trust they gave to me and my work.

Finally, I wish to thank my family and friends for their loving support, encouragement and patience throughout my study. I would like to especially mention Anika, Andrea and Luis. Furthermore, I am greatly indebted to countless persons who have inspired my professional and personal life throughout the last years and motivated me to do my best.

*June 2020*

*Ilka Roose*

## Contents

Acknowledgments	5
Contents	7
List of Boxes, Figures and Tables	10
List of Abbreviations	13
Part 1: Introduction	15
1. Chile against the current: water governance facing climate change	15
1.1 Zooming into Chile: spatial patterns of water conflicts	19
1.2 The emblematic case of Petorca	22
2. Research question	23
Part 2: Conceptual framework and theoretical background	25
3. Definition of central terms	25
4. Conceptualizing and methods	27
5. An institutionalist perspective on social-ecological systems	33
5.1 Contributions of Ostrom's social-ecological system framework to this study	46
5.2 Actor-centered institutionalism in the light of water governance	49
5.2.1 Actors	50
5.2.2 Action orientation	52
5.2.3 Action situation and scope of action	53
5.2.4 Actors constellations and modes of action	53
5.3 Syntheses and the role of game theory and social innovation	55
6. Hypotheses	60
Part 3: Results	68
7. The social-ecological system of Petorca Province	68
7.1 Social, economic, and political setting	71
7.2 Related ecosystems	82
7.3 Resource system and resource unit	87
7.4 Governance systems	92

*Contents*

7.5	Actors and action orientation	103
7.5.1	Actor group: civil society	106
7.5.1.1	Local leaders	106
7.5.1.2	Activists	113
7.5.1.3	Citizens	121
7.5.2	Actor group: governmental bodies and authorities	129
7.5.2.1	Local authorities	129
7.5.2.2	Regional authorities	136
7.5.2.2	National authorities	142
7.5.3	Actor group: economy	148
7.5.3.1	Large-scale agriculture	148
7.5.3.2	Water provider	159
7.5.4	Others	161
7.5.4.1	Padre Fernando	161
7.5.4.2	Susana	164
7.5.4.3	Maria	166
7.5.4.4	Alfredo	169
Part 4: Discussion		172
8.	The focal action situation: flows of water governance in Petorca	172
8.1	Market-based institutional framework	173
8.2	Patterns of interaction orientation	181
8.2.1	Individualistic behavior, competition and low cooperation	182
8.2.2	Cooperative quality of collaborative projects in the field	185
8.2.3	Social innovations in Petorca	191
8.3	Mechanisms of market-based water governance and low cooperation	194
8.3.2	Low level of trust	195
8.3.3	Transparency restricted by communication gaps and biases	196
8.3.4	Lack of enforcement	198
8.3.5	Inner, experienced heuristics, norms and rules	200
8.3.6	Ambiguous impact of ecological factors	210
8.3.7	Conection factors: institutional entropy and inequality	211
8.4	Leverage points for enhanced cooperation	216
8.4.1	Fostering transparency with the help of trust-worthy facilitators	217
8.4.2	Overcoming heterogeneity and rejection of politics by highlighting social and economic benefits	220

8.4.3	Establishing information and fairness by self-organization and institutional bricolage	222
8.4.4	Remaining challenges of social innovations	224
8.5	From here to where? Towards polycentric water governance on river basin scale	226
8.5.1	Politics and polity suggestions	229
8.5.2	Policy suggestions	234
Part 5: Conclusions		236
9.	Empirical findings	236
10.	Theoretical and practical significance of this study	239
11.	Limitations of this study and recommendations for future research	242
References		244

## List of Boxes, Figures and Tables

Box 1:	Outstanding conflicts in Chile between 2015-2016	76
Box 2:	Description of coordinating body taking the example of Oficina de Asuntos Hidricos	232
Figure 1:	The names and number of all Chilean administrative regions and climatic regions. (Aitken et al. 2016)	20
Figure 2:	Actor mind map template. (Own illustration based on Scharpf 1997)	32
Figure 3:	The cooperation hexagon. (Adapted from Messner et al. 2013: 15)	58
Figure 4:	Synthesis of SESF and AI. (Adapted from McGinnis and Ostrom 2014: 4 modified by Roose based on Scharpf 2006)	60
Figure 5:	Upward spiral of social innovations. (Own illustration)	67
Figure 6:	Map of Petorca Province. (Adapted from DGA 2012 in CNR and Universidad de Concepción 2016: 26 modified by Roose)	69
Figure 7:	Income poverty in Petorca Province. (Data from BCN 2018a, b, c)	73
Figure 8:	Groundwater use Petorca River basin. (Own illustration derieved from data from DGA 2012 in CNR and Universidad de Concepción 2016: 232)	90
Figure 9:	Groundwater use in La Ligua river basin (Own illustration derieved from data from DGA 2012 in CNR and Universidad de Concepción 2016: 232)	90

Figure 10: Complex scenario of collective action in Petorca. (Own illustration based on Ostrom 2005: 59).	195
Figure 11: Impact of social innovations (colored in red) on complex scenario of collective action in Petorca. (Own illustration based on Ostrom 2005: 59)	217
Figure 12: Polycentric water governance on river basin scale. (Own illustration)	229
Table 1: Types of actors in water governance. Categories of AI shaded in grey. (Derieved from Hourdret and Shabafrouz 2006, Scharpf 2006 and modified by Roose)	51
Table 2: Categories and tiers. (Based on McGinnis and Ostrom 2014 and Roose)	70
Table 3: Population growth, age and gender structure in Petorca, La Ligua and Cabildo Districts. (Data from BCN 2018a, b, c )	74
Table 4: Reported crimes per year in Petorca, La Ligua and Cabildo Districts. (Data from BCN 2018a, b, c)	77
Table 5: Basic data about La Ligua River and Petorca River. (Data from DGA 2018)	88
Table 6: Water rights and water availability in Petorca Province. (Data from MOP and DGA 2015)	91
Table 7: Rule-making organizations. Public Sector. (Aldunce et al. 2015 modified by Roose)	94
Table 8: Rule-making organizations. Private Sector and Civil Society. (Aldunce et al. 2015 modified by Roose)	95
Table 9: Selected actor groups for interview analysis. (Own research)	105
Table 10: Local leaders. (Own research)	107

*List of Boxes, Figures and Tables*

Table 11: Activists. (Own research)	114
Table 12: Citizens. (Own research)	122
Table 13: Local authorities. (Own research)	129
Table 14: Regional authorities. (Own research)	136
Table 15: National authorities. (Own research)	142
Table 16: Large-scale agriculture. (Own research)	149
Table 17: Water provider. (Own research)	159
Table 18: Padre Fernando. (Own research)	162
Table 19: Susana. (Own research)	164
Table 20: Maria. (Own research)	166
Table 21: Alfredo. (Own research)	169
Table 22: Orientation of Interaction between actor groups in Petorca Province. (Own research)	183
Table 23: Large-scale projects aiming to solve water scarcity in Petorca. (Own research)	187
Table 24: Social innovations (SI) in Petorca Province. (Based on TEPSIE (2014: 15) and Scheidewind et al. (1997) and own research)	191

## List of Abbreviations

AC	Asociaciones de Canalistas (Canal Association)
AI	Actor-centered institutionalism (Mayntz and Scharf 1995)
APR	<i>Comité o asociación de agua potable rural</i> (Potable water association or committee)
CASF	<i>Comunidad de Aguas superficiales</i> (Surface water community)
CAST	<i>Comunidad de Aguas subterráneas</i> (Groundwater community)
CNR	<i>Comisión Nacional de Riego</i> (National Irrigation Commission)
CONADI	<i>Corporación Nacional de Desarrollo Indígena</i> (National Indigenous Development Corporation)
CORFO	<i>Corporación de Fomento de la Producción</i> (Chilean economic development agency)
CPR	Common-pool resources
DGA	<i>Dirrección Nacional de Aguas</i> (National Water Directive)
DOH	<i>Dirrección de Obras Hidraulicas</i> (Directive of Hydraulic Works)
FIA	<i>Fundación para la innovación agraria</i> (Foundation for Agricultural Innovation)
INDAP	<i>Instituto de Desarrollo Agropecuario</i> (Institute of Farming Development)
IAD	Institutional analysis and development framework (Ostrom 2005a)
JV	<i>Junta de Vigilancia</i>
LSAA	Large-scale agriculture association
M <sub>1</sub>	Mechanisms underlying hypothesis 1
M <sub>2</sub>	Mechanisms underlying hypothesis 2
MMA	<i>Ministerio del Medio Ambiente</i> (Ministry of Environment)
MINAGRI	<i>Ministerio de Agricultura</i> (Ministry of Agricultura)
MODATIMA	<i>Movimiento de Defensa por el acceso al Agua, la Tierra y la Protección del Medioambiente</i> (Movement in Defense of Access to Water, Land and Environmental Protection)
MOP	<i>Ministerio de Obras Públicas</i> (Ministry of Public Works)
OAH	<i>Oficina de Asuntos Hídricos</i>
ONEMI	<i>Oficina Nacional de Emergencia del Ministerio del Interior y Seguridad Pública</i> (National Emergency Office of the Ministry of Interior Affairs and Public Security)
PGH	<i>Programa de Gestión Hídrica</i>
PRODESAL	<i>Programa de Desarrollo Local</i> (Local Development Program)
PUCV	<i>Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso</i>

*List of Abbreviations*

SESF	Social-ecological system framework (Ostrom 2007, 2009)
SISS	<i>Superintendencia de Servicios Sanitarios</i> (Superintendence of Sanitary Services)
SI	Social innovation
SUBDERE	<i>Subsecretaría de Desarrollo Regional y Administrativo</i> (Undersecretariat for Regional and Administrative Development)
UTM	<i>Unidades tribunals mensuales</i> (monthly fiscal unit)
WUO	Water user organization