

Schriftenreihe des  
EUROPA-KOLLEGS HAMBURG  
zur Integrationsforschung

78

Christoph M. Sielmann

# Governing Difference: Internal and External Differentiation in European Union Law



**Nomos**

Schriftenreihe des  
EUROPA-KOLLEGS HAMBURG  
zur Integrationsforschung

Herausgegeben von  
Prof. Dr. Peter Behrens  
Prof. Dr. Sigrid Boysen  
Prof. Dr. Thomas Bruha  
Prof. Dr. Thomas Eger  
Prof. Dr. Armin Hatje  
Prof. Dr. Markus Kotzur  
Prof. Dr. Gert Nicolaysen<sup>†</sup>  
Prof. Dr. Stefan Oeter  
Prof. Dr. Jörg Philipp Terhechte  
Prof. Dr. Wolf Schäfer<sup>†</sup>

Band 78

Christoph M. Sielmann

**Governing Difference:  
Internal and External Differentiation  
in European Union Law**



**Nomos**

The **Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Hamburg, Univ., Diss., 2019

Original title: Bridging Divides, Governing Difference: Differentiation in European Union Law

ISBN 978-3-8487-6858-5 (Print)  
978-3-7489-0954-5 (ePDF)

#### **British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-6858-5 (Print)  
978-3-7489-0954-5 (ePDF)

#### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Sielmann, Christoph M.

Governing Difference: Internal and External Differentiation in European Union Law

Christoph M. Sielmann

512 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-6858-5 (Print)  
978-3-7489-0954-5 (ePDF)



Onlineversion  
Nomos eLibrary

1st Edition 2020

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2020. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to “Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort”, Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

## Acknowledgments

This book is a slightly revised and updated version of my doctoral thesis which was accepted by the University of Hamburg's *Fakultät für Rechtswissenschaft* in October 2019.

There are several people and institutions without whose consistent and tremendous support this work could not have been accomplished.

First of all, I would like to thank my *Doktorvater*, Professor Dr. Markus Kotzur, LL.M. (Duke), for his continuous and extraordinary support and guidance throughout all stages of this work, his very valuable insights and advice, as well as his help for my other academic ventures.

I am also grateful to Professor Dr. Armin Hatje for the swift preparation of the second opinion as well as for his helpful remarks.

Furthermore, I would like to thank the editors of the *Schriftenreihe des Europa-Kollegs Hamburg zur Integrationsforschung* for accepting this work as a part of the series.

I would also like to thank the libraries of the European Commission and the Council of the European Union in Brussels, where I wrote parts of this work.

Finally, I thank Vivian for her infinite support and inspiration, and my family, most of all my parents, for all they have done for me. I couldn't have asked for more.

Christoph M. Sielmann

Hamburg, May 2020



## Table of Contents

Abbreviations	13
Introduction	19
Part One: The Basics of Differentiated Integration	21
A. Theoretical Foundations	21
I. The Term and Concept of European Integration	21
1. Economic Integration	23
2. Regional/Political Integration	27
a. Supranationality	29
b. Federation	31
c. Concluding Remarks on Regional/Political Integration	33
3. European Integration and the Legal Mechanisms of Its Implementation	34
II. The Term Differentiated Integration	38
III. The Normative Concepts Behind Differentiated Integration	42
1. Of Leaders and Laggards: Multi-Speed Europe	43
2. The Two Europes: Variable Geometry, Concentric Circles, and Core Europe	45
3. The Shiver down the Spine: Europe à la carte	47
B. Theory in Context, or the Past and Present of Differentiated Integration	50
I. The Origins of European Integration	52
II. Early European Cooperation in the Early Post-War Era	55
III. The Beginning of European Integration in the 1950s	56
IV. The Beginning of Differentiated Integration amid a Crisis-Torn Europe	61
V. The Revival of European Integration in the 1980s	65
VI. More Integration, More Differentiation: Europe in the 1990s	67
VII. The (Further) Institutionalization of Differentiated Integration in the 2000s	72
VIII. Europe After Lisbon: A Differentiated Union?	78

*Table of Contents*

Part Two: Incidents of Internal Differentiated Integration	84
A. The European Unitary Patent	84
I. The Patent	86
II. The European Patent (Under the European Patent Convention)	87
III. The Unitary Patent of the European Union	92
1. The First Community Patent Conventions (the 1960s and 1970s)	92
2. The Second Attempt (the 1980s and 1990s)	94
3. Further Attempts in the New Millennium	95
4. Last Exit: Enhanced Cooperation	97
5. The Court Decides About Enhanced Cooperation	101
a. Joined Cases C-274/11 and C-295/11	102
b. Cases 146/13 and 147/13	109
6. The Status Quo of the European Unitary Patent	110
IV. The European Unitary Patent as an Example of Differentiated Integration	111
1. The Concrete Differentiations and Their Legal Framework	111
2. The Reasons for Differentiation	112
3. How Did It Work? – Concepts, Risks, and Evaluation	116
B. Differentiation in Economic and Monetary Policy	120
I. The Historical Context of Economic and Monetary Integration	120
1. The Beginnings in the Early Post-War Era	121
2. The First Major Proposals and Steps	123
3. The European Monetary System (EMS)	124
4. The Introduction of the Euro	126
a. Britain	130
b. Denmark	131
c. Sweden	134
5. The Eurozone Crisis	136
II. The Eurozone as an Example of Differentiated Integration	144
1. Differentiation in Primary Law	145
a. Article 136 (1) TFEU	147
b. Further Provisions	157
2. Institutional Differentiation	157
a. The Council	158
b. The ECB	159



c. The Eurogroup	160
d. The Euro Summit	162
e. Concluding Remarks	164
3. Financial Assistance Instruments Outside of the Treaties	166
a. The EFSF	166
b. The ESM	167
c. Interrelations Between the ESM/EFSF and the Union	173
d. The Flaws in Union Law on Differentiation	177
4. Strengthening Fiscal Discipline Through International Agreements	180
5. Differentiation in Secondary Law	189
6. Are the Non-Euro Member States Obligated to Adopt the Euro?	193
7. The Reasons for Differentiation	202
8. Reforming the Eurozone, Deepening Differentiation	204
a. A Eurozone Budget	205
b. A Eurozone Government	212
c. A Eurozone Parliament	215
9. Final Remarks	220
C. Differentiation in Security and Defense Policy	222
I. The Difficulties of Military Integration and the Potential for Differentiation	222
II. Bilateral and Minilateral Cooperation and Integration	228
III. The Cooperative Financial Mechanism	229
IV. The European Defence Fund (EDF)	229
V. Permanent Structured Cooperation (PESCO)	231
Part Three: The Legal Foundations of Differentiated Integration	237
A. The Legality of Differentiated Integration	237
I. Differentiation and the Principle of Solidarity	242
II. Differentiation and the Principle of Equality	251
1. Equality of Union Citizens	252
2. Equality of Member States	261
III. Differentiation and the Principle of Loyalty	267
IV. Differentiation and the Principles of Homogeneity and Legal Uniformity	279
1. The Principle of Homogeneity	280

*Table of Contents*

2. The Principle of Legal Uniformity	282
a. Territorial Uniformity and the Legal and Institutional Order of the Union	284
b. Territorial Uniformity and the Objectives of the Union	288
c. Concluding Remarks on Territorial Uniformity	293
V. Conclusion	294
B. The Legal Avenues of Differentiated Integration	295
I. Enhanced Cooperation	296
1. The Legality and Authorization of Enhanced Cooperation	298
2. The Implementation of Enhanced Cooperation	306
3. The Effects of Enhanced Cooperation	310
4. Specific Forms of Enhanced Cooperation	314
a. Enhanced Cooperation in the Field of Judicial and Police Cooperation	315
b. Permanent Structured Cooperation in the Field of Security and Defense Policy	316
c. Enhanced Cooperation in Eurozone Integration	321
II. International Agreements Among Member States (Inter Se Agreements)	322
1. The Legality of Inter Se Agreements	324
a. Compatibility with Article 351 TFEU	329
b. Compatibility with the Provisions on Enhanced Cooperation	329
c. Compatibility with Article 350 TFEU	335
d. Compatibility with the Principle of Loyalty	336
e. Concluding Remarks	342
2. The Use of Union Institutions by Inter Se Agreements	343
a. Use of the Court of Justice	343
b. Use of Other Union Institutions	345
3. Conclusion	354
III. Opt-Out and Opt-In Clauses	354
IV. Transitional Provisions	361
V. Safeguard Clauses	363
VI. Derogation Clauses	365
VII. The Directive as a Form of Differentiation	366
VIII. Union Legal Acts Which (Effectively) Bind Only Some Member States	368

IX. Differentiation Through the Limited Territorial Scope of the Treaties	370
X. External Differentiated Integration	372
Part Four: Incidents of External Differentiated Integration: Norway and Switzerland	375
A. The European Union and Its Relationship with Non-Member States	376
B. A True Northern Star? – Norway’s Involvement in European Integration	380
I. Why Norway Is Not Part of the European Union	381
II. The European Economic Area (EEA)	384
1. The Acquis of the EEA	385
2. How Does It Work? The Functioning of the EEA	388
3. The Issue of Uniformity Between the Two Courts	396
4. Primacy, Direct Effect, and State Liability	407
5. Concluding Remarks	413
III. Norway’s Involvement Beyond the EEA	416
C. Last Man Standing? – Switzerland’s Involvement in European Integration	419
I. Why Switzerland is Not Part of the European Union	420
II. The Bilateral Agreements	425
1. Cooperation Agreements	430
2. How Does It Work? The Legal Acquis of the Bilateral Agreements	431
3. The Issue of Uniformity of Interpretation and Application of Common Law	438
4. Concluding Remarks	443
III. Switzerland’s Involvement Beyond the Bilateral Agreements	450
D. Two Integration Rebels: Concluding Remarks on Norway and Switzerland in European Integration	452
Part Five: Governing Difference, or the Present and Future of Differentiated Integration	454
I. The Benefits and Risks of Differentiated Integration	454
II. The Governability of Differentiated Integration	456
III. Internal Differentiation	459
IV. External Differentiation	463

*Table of Contents*

V. Post-Brexit Britain's Role in European Integration	468
VI. The Final Problem	471
Bibliography	483

## Abbreviations

Acad Manage J	Academy of Management Journal
ACP	African, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States
AIV Adv Rep	AIV Advisory Reports
AJCL	American Journal of Comparative Law
Am Bar Assoc J	American Bar Association Journal
Annu Rev Polit Sci	Annual Review of Political Science
ARENA WP	Arena Working Paper
ASILS Int L J	ASILS International Law Journal
Aussenwirtschaft	Aussenwirtschaft: Schweizerische Zeitschrift für internationale Wirtschaftsbeziehungen
AVR	Archiv des Völkerrechts
BBl	Bundesblatt (Swiss federal gazette)
BI NSM Rep	BI Norwegian School of Management Reports
BJPIR	The British Journal of Politics and International Relations
Bruegel PB	Bruegel Policy Brief
BVerfGE	Amtliche Sammlung des Bundesverfassungsgerichts (German Federal Constitutional Court: Decisions)
Cambr L J	Cambridge Law Journal
Case W Res J Int L	Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law
CEPS SR	CEPS Special Report
Chi J Int L	Chicago Journal of International Law
CJEU	Court of Justice of the EU
CML Rev	Common Market Law Review
Colum J Eur L	Columbia Journal of European Law
Colum J Transnatl L	Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
Contemp Eur Hist	Contemporary European History

*Abbreviations*

Conv	The European Convention: Documents
Coop Confl	Cooperation and Conflict
Cornell Int Law J	Cornell International Law Journal
CSDP	Common Security and Defence Policy (EU)
CSF-SSSUP WP	CSF-SSSUP Working Paper Series
Cypr Rev	The Cyprus Review
DÖV	Die öffentliche Verwaltung
DR	Digital Reports of the European Court of Justice
DVBl	Das Deutsche Verwaltungsblatt
EBLR	European Business Law Review
ECB	European Central Bank
ECB Legal WP	ECB Legal Working Paper Series
Econ J Watch	Econ Journal Watch
ECR	European Court Reports
ECSC	European Coal and Steel Community
EDA	European Defence Agency
EDC	European Defence Community
EDF	European Defence Fund
EEA	European Economic Area
EEC	European Economic Community
EFSF	European Financial Stability Facility
EFSM	European Financial Stabilisation Mechanism
EFTA	European Free Trade Association
EIB	European Investment Bank
ELJ	European Law Journal
ELRev	European Law Review
EMS	European Monetary System
ENP	European Neighbourhood Policy
EPC	European Political Community
EPC	European Patent Convention
EPL	European Public Law
EPO	European Patent Office

EPU	European Payments Union
ESA	EFTA Surveillance Authority
ESCB	European System of Central Banks
ESM	European Stability Mechanism
EU Polit	European Union Politics (Journal)
EuConst	European Constitutional Law Review
EuGRZ	Europäische Grundrechte-Zeitschrift
EUI MWP	EUI Max Weber Programme Working Papers
EUI RSCAS WP	EUI Working Papers: RSCAS
EuR	Europarecht (Journal)
Eur Foreign Aff Rev	European Foreign Affairs Review
Eur J Law Econ	European Journal of Law and Economics
Eur J Polit Res	European Journal of Political Research
Eur Plan Stud	European Planning Studies
EURATOM	European Atomic Energy Community
EuZW	Europäische Zeitschrift für Wirtschaftsrecht
EWS	Europäisches Wirtschafts- & Steuerrecht
Fordham Int L J	Fordham International Law Journal
Foreign Aff	Foreign Affairs
FTA	Free trade agreement
GLJ	German Law Journal
Gov Oppos	Government and Opposition
GPA Agreement	Agreement on Government Procurement
GRUR	Gewerblicher Rechtsschutz und Urheberrecht
GRUR Int	Gewerblicher Rechtsschutz und Urheberrecht Internationaler Teil
Harv JM WP	Harvard Jean Monnet Working Paper
HC Libr Res Pap	House of Commons Library Research Paper
IAI WP	Istituto Affari Internazionali Working Paper
IDEA	IDEA: The Journal of Law and Technology
IHS Polit Scie Ser	IHS Political Science Series
IIC	International Review of Intellectual Property and Competition Law

*Abbreviations*

IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMF Staff Disc Note	IMF Staff Discussion Notes
Indus Prop Q	Industrial Property Quarterly
Int Aff	International Affairs
Int Comp Law Q	International & Comparative Law Quarterly
Int Finance	International Finance
J Common Mark Stud	Journal of Common Market Studies
J Conflict Resolut	Journal of Conflict Resolution
J Delors Instit PP	Jacques Delors Institut Policy Paper
J Eur Econ Assoc	Journal of the European Economic Association
J Eur Integr Hist	Journal of European Integration History
J Eur Intgr	Journal of European Integration
J Eur Public Policy	Journal of European Public Policy
J Pat Off Soc'y	Journal of the Patent and Trademark Office Society
JÖR Geg	Jahrbuch des öffentlichen Rechts der Gegenwart
JZ	JuristenZeitung
LeGes	LeGes – Gesetzgebung & Evaluation
LIEI	Legal Issues of Economic Integration
Loy L.A. L Rev	Loyola of Los Angeles International & Comparative Law Review
Maastricht Eur Priv Law Inst WP	Maastricht European Private Law Institute Working Paper
Maastricht J Eur Comp L	Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law
Mich Law Rev	Michigan Law Review
MLR	The Modern Law Review
Monash Univ Law Rev	Monash University Law Review
MPI Intell Prop Comp Law Res Pap	Max Planck Institute for Intellectual Property and Competition Law Research Paper Series
Nat Biotech	Nature Biotechnology
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NJW	Neue Juristische Wochenschrift



Nord J Int L	Nordic Journal of International Law
Notre Europe PP	Notre Europe Policy Paper
NUPI Rep	Norsk Utenrikspolitisk Institutt Report
NYIL	Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OEEC	Organisation for European Economic Co-operation
OJ	Official Journal of the European Union/ Official Journal of the European Communities
OMTs	Outright Monetary Transactions
Organ Stud	Organization Studies
Oxford Bus Tax WP	Oxford University Centre for Business Taxation Working Paper
Oxford J Legal Stud	Oxford Journal of Legal Studies
PESCO	Permanent structured cooperation in the field of security and defense policy
PLT	Patent Law Treaty
Polit Quart	The Political Quarterly
PVS	Politische Vierteljahresschrift
REDP	Revue Europeenne de Droit Public
RTD eur	Revue trimestrielle de droit européen
Santa Clara Comput High Technol Law J	Santa Clara Computer & High Technology Law Journal
Scand Polit Stud	Scandinavian Political Studies
SEA	Single European Act
SPSR	Swiss Political Science Review
Technol Cult	Technology and Culture
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
Trésor-Econ	Trésor-Economics

*Abbreviations*

TSCG	Fiscal Compact (Treaty on Stability, Coordination and Governance in the Economic and Monetary Union)
Uniform Law Rev	Uniform Law Review / Revue de droit uniforme
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
UPCA	Agreement on a Unified Patent Court
WAI-ZEI Paper	West Africa Institute / Center for European Integration Studies Paper
Wash Law Rev	Washington Law Review
West Eur Polit	West European Politics
WTO	World Trade Organization
YEL	Yearbook of European Law
ZaöRV	Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht
ZEuS	Zeitschrift für Europarechtliche Studien