

Europäische Schriften  
zu Staat und Wirtschaft

42

Marion Cornelia Schwärzler

# The Multiregional Health Account

A Multiregional Analysis of the Health Economy in Germany



**Nomos**

Europäische Schriften  
zu Staat und Wirtschaft

edited by Prof. Dr. Klaus-Dirk Henke  
Technische Universität Berlin  
Fakultät Wirtschaft und Management

Volume 42

Marion Cornelia Schwärzler

# The Multiregional Health Account

A Multiregional Analysis of the Health Economy in Germany



**Nomos**

Der Druck dieser wissenschaftlichen Arbeit wurde gefördert von:



Promotionsort: Bremen  
Termin des Prüfungskolloquiums: 18.10.2018  
Erste Gutachterin: Frau Prof. Dr. Jutta Günther  
Zweiter Gutachter: Herr Prof. Dr. Tobias Kronenberg

**The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek** lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Bremen, Univ., Diss., 2018

ISBN 978-3-8487-5655-1 (Print)  
978-3-8452-9734-7 (ePDF)

**British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-5655-1 (Print)  
978-3-8452-9734-7 (ePDF)

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Schwärzler, Marion Cornelia  
The Multiregional Health Account  
A Multiregional Analysis of the Health Economy in Germany  
Marion Cornelia Schwärzler  
227 p.  
Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-5655-1 (Print)  
978-3-8452-9734-7 (ePDF)

1st Edition 2019

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2019. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author(s)/editor(s).

## Acknowledgements

The dissertation at hand is the result of four years of research I do not want to miss. I look at it proudly since it means something special to me, accompanying me for such a long time through both happy and rough times. Over these years, I let it grow with hard work and endurance so it became a piece of work I link to many experiences, which finally characterize both my dissertation and my person. Throughout those years, I have met several people, who had great influence to both my life and my dissertation, to whom I would like to express my particular thanks:

First, I want to thank the two people, who made it even possible for me to present this research output as a dissertation at this point. Both my supervisors, Prof. Dr. Jutta Günther and Prof. Dr. Tobias Kronenberg, have provided me with the feeling that my research is interesting and worth discussing. This feeling supported me to believe in what I am doing also in hard times. It felt like true and honest support I received from both of them. I feel absolutely honored to be supervised by two such professional researchers in this field.

I would also like to extend my thanks to the German Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy, represented by Dr. Rüdiger Leidner, Jochen Puth-Weißenfels and Dr. Toni Glaser, for their interest in this research field. Without their support, I would not have been able to conduct the present and earlier research regarding the economic contribution of the German health economy to this extent.

In this context, of course, my former employer, WifOR, played an essential role. Therefore, I would like to thank WifOR, represented by Dr. Dennis Ostwald and Benno Legler, for supporting this direction of research, so I was able to apply my research findings in several projects.

I will never forget the contribution of earlier project partners, Dr. Markus Schneider and Thomas Krauss from the research institute BASYS, who challenged my approaches especially in the first years of research with their critical queries. I am grateful they did so, since it further ignited my ambitions, at the same time knowing that competition and friendship can be closely allied.

This and further research regarding the German health economy could not have been accomplished to this extent without the support of the Federal Statistical Office, represented by Angela Höh. She did not only act as a

### *Acknowledgements*

representative of the Federal Statistical Office in providing an essential database for this research, but also spent much time to patiently listen and reply to my questions, for which I am very grateful.

A particular mention is worthwhile for Johannes Többen, who acted as a trailblazer for this research. Even in times he had not yet finished his own dissertation at Rijksuniversiteit Groningen, he was always keen to supply me with helpful information, encouraged me to participate at conferences and hinted towards papers, which might be helpful in the context of my research.

Thanks to Benno, the most important person in my life during the last years. He had the challenging role of being my direct superior at WifOR, my partner and my best friend at the same time. Therefore, he had always had my interests in the context of my dissertation as my direct superior in mind, yet much more was a wonderful partner, who reassured and comforted me, providing me with sufficient space so I could focus on my dissertation. At the same time, he was my most critical friend, who incited me to deliver top performances with his support and input. I know, this time has been challenging and I thank Benno for his patience and understanding.

Finally yet importantly, thanks to my beloved family, who supported me throughout the whole time and helped me restore the necessary easiness in times of concerns and powerlessness. At the same time, they provided me with feedback in times outside opinion was necessary in order to focus on the essential further steps. It was a wonderful experience to know that I can count on your support despite quite a geographical distance between us.

## Table of Contents

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Abbreviations   | 17 |
| Country codes   | 19 |
| 1. Introduction   | 21 |
| 1.1. Background and motivation  | 21 |
| 1.2. Outline of the following chapters  | 22 |
| 2. Methodology of the National Health Account for Germany                         | 25 |
| 2.1. Introduction   | 25 |
| 2.2. Historical background and paradigm shift concerning health care              | 27 |
| 2.3. Methodological background  | 30 |
| 2.3.1. International standards  | 30 |
| 2.3.2. Underlying database  | 33 |
| 2.3.3. Principles of the National Health Account                                  | 37 |
| 2.4. Compilation methodology  | 38 |
| 2.4.1. Compilation of health-specific supply and use tables at basic prices       | 39 |
| 2.4.1.1. Product specific splitting with respect to health areas                  | 40 |
| 2.4.1.2. Industry-specific splitting with respect to health areas                 | 43 |
| 2.4.1.3. Product specific aggregation   | 47 |
| 2.4.1.4. Reconciliation of input structure  | 49 |
| 2.4.1.5. Industry-specific alignment  | 53 |
| 2.4.2. Compilation of health-specific supply and use tables at purchasers' prices | 56 |
| 2.4.3. Employees and composition of gross value added                             | 57 |
| 2.4.4. Calculation of the Health-Input-Output Table                               | 58 |
| 2.4.5. Compilation of time series data  | 58 |
| 2.5. Concluding remarks   | 60 |

*Table of Contents*

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 3. Methodology of the Multiregional Health Account for Germany                          | 61  |
| 3.1. Introduction   | 61  |
| 3.2. Motivation   | 64  |
| 3.3. Methodological background  | 68  |
| 3.3.1. Principles of the multiregional and national health account                      | 68  |
| 3.3.2. Differences to existing methodology for the regionalization of national accounts | 69  |
| 3.3.3. The multiregional context  | 74  |
| 3.4. Compilation methodology  | 79  |
| 3.4.1. Preparation of data  | 79  |
| 3.4.1.1. Special evaluation of supply and use tables                                    | 80  |
| 3.4.1.2. Regional accounts  | 80  |
| 3.4.1.3. Trade statistics   | 84  |
| 3.4.1.4. Changes in inventories and amount of interregional trade                       | 89  |
| 3.4.1.5. Employees subject to social security contribution                              | 91  |
| 3.4.1.6. Health expenditure   | 93  |
| 3.4.2. Alignment of the initial matrix  | 98  |
| 3.4.3. Basic concept of the SUT-RAS algorithm   | 103 |
| 3.4.4. The MR-SUT-RAS   | 108 |
| 3.4.5. First evaluation of the derived multiregional supply and use tables              | 115 |
| 3.4.6. Calculation of the satellite account from multiregional accounts                 | 119 |
| 3.5. Concluding remarks   | 120 |
| 4. Validation of Direct Effects of the Health Economy                                   | 123 |
| 4.1. Introduction   | 123 |
| 4.2. Motivation   | 124 |
| 4.3. Direct effects of the health economy in 2011                                       | 125 |
| 4.3.1. The overall health economy in the German federal states in 2011                  | 126 |
| 4.3.2. Characteristics of medication supply in German federal states in 2011            | 132 |



|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 4.4. Direct effects of the health economy during the period 2006 to 2015                   | 138 |
| 4.4.1. The overall health economy in the German federal states during 2006 to 2015         | 139 |
| 4.4.2. Characteristics of medication supply in German federal states 2006 - 2015           | 142 |
| 4.5. Concluding remarks  | 148 |
| 5. Validation of Indirect Effects of the Health Economy                                    | 150 |
| 5.1. Introduction  | 150 |
| 5.2. Indirect output effects of selected categories of the health economy                  | 152 |
| 5.2.1. Indirect effects of medication manufacturing in German federal states in 2011       | 154 |
| 5.2.2. Indirect effects of medical products manufacturing in German federal states in 2011 | 159 |
| 5.2.3. Indirect effects of in- and outpatient treatment in German federal states in 2011   | 162 |
| 5.2.4. Indirect effects of organic food supply in German federal states in 2011            | 164 |
| 5.2.5. Indirect effects of health tourism in German federal states in 2011                 | 168 |
| 5.3. Concluding remarks  | 171 |
| 6. A Financial Equalization Scheme to Cope with Lagging Investments in German Hospitals    | 172 |
| 6.1. Introduction  | 172 |
| 6.2. Background and challenges in the context of investments in German hospitals           | 174 |
| 6.2.1. Determining factors   | 174 |
| 6.2.1.1. Heterogeneities among federal states  | 174 |
| 6.2.1.2. Hospital Finance Act  | 176 |
| 6.2.1.3. Existing compensation mechanisms in the German health system                      | 177 |
| 6.2.2. Current situation on the lagging investments in German hospitals                    | 180 |
| 6.2.3. Future challenges   | 183 |

*Table of Contents*

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 6.3. Existing approaches and introduction to the proposed approach                              | 185 |
| 6.3.1. Existing approaches  | 185 |
| 6.3.2. Problem formulation  | 187 |
| 6.3.3. Proposed approach  | 188 |
| 6.4. Data base and empirical approach   | 188 |
| 6.4.1. Data base  | 188 |
| 6.4.2. Empirical approach   | 191 |
| 6.5. Results and discussion   | 194 |
| 6.5.1. Results  | 194 |
| 6.5.2. Discussion   | 198 |
| 6.6. Concluding remarks   | 200 |
| 7. Conclusion   | 202 |
| 7.1. Methodological contribution to subnational multiregional<br>input-output analysis          | 202 |
| 7.2. Contribution to a thorough understanding of the health<br>economy in German federal states | 204 |
| 7.3. Contribution to the debate about hospital financing in<br>Germany                          | 206 |
| Appendix  | 208 |
| References  | 209 |

## List of figures

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Figure 1: Simplified supply and use framework in the dimension of available data.                  | 34 |
| Figure 2: Final accounting framework of the NHA  | 40 |
| Figure 3: Product- and industry-specific separation of supply and use table with respect to health | 46 |
| Figure 4: Initial situation with identical relative input structures of disaggregated industries   | 50 |
| Figure 5: Adjustment of input structures and consolidation with GRAS algorithm                     | 51 |
| Figure 6: Initial situation of industries before alignment into health categories                  | 54 |
| Figure 7: Final situation of industry alignment into health groups                                 | 56 |
| Figure 8: Multiregional use table in a 3 regional economy  | 75 |
| Figure 9: Multiregional supply table in a 3 regional economy                                       | 77 |
| Figure 10: Steps of compilation  | 78 |
| Figure 11: Consolidation of disaggregated regional accounts data                                   | 83 |
| Figure 12: Available and missing data  | 90 |
| Figure 13: Imbalance between industry- and product-specific information in the supply table        | 92 |
| Figure 14: Assumptions on the origins of health goods for region 1                                 | 96 |
| Figure 15: Assumptions on the origins of health products in region 1, region 2 and region 3        | 97 |

*List of figures*

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Figure 16: Weights for the initial matrix on domestic (German) use.  | 101 |
| Figure 17: Data requirements for the SUT-RAS algorithm   | 105 |
| Figure 18: Calculation of iteratively changing fixed values.   | 109 |
| Figure 19: Aggregated initial domestic use matrix  | 117 |
| Figure 20: Aggregated final domestic use matrix  | 118 |
| Figure 21: GVA share of the health economy, 2011   | 127 |
| Figure 22: GVA of the health economy per inhabitant, 2011  | 127 |
| Figure 23: Employment share of the health economy, 2011  | 128 |
| Figure 24: Productivity of the health economy, 2011  | 128 |
| Figure 25: Relationship between labor productivity of the health economy and share of industrial segment, 2011 | 129 |
| Figure 26: International export share of the health economy, 2011  | 130 |
| Figure 27: Import share of the health economy, 2011  | 130 |
| Figure 28: International trade balance of the health economy, 2011   | 131 |
| Figure 29: Output of medication in German federal states by characteristic, absolute values, 2011              | 133 |
| Figure 30: Output of medication in German federal states by characteristic, relative shares, 2011              | 134 |
| Figure 31: Sites and subsidiaries of selected pharmaceutical companies   | 135 |
| Figure 32: GVA growth rates of the health economy, 2006-2015   | 140 |
| Figure 33: Employment growth rates of the health economy, 2006-2015  | 140 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Figure 34: Export growth rates of the health economy, 2006-2015                               | 141 |
| Figure 35: Import growth rates of the health economy, 2006-2015                               | 141 |
| Figure 36: Output of medication in Berlin by characteristic, absolute values, 2006-2015       | 143 |
| Figure 37: Output of medication in Berlin by characteristic, relative values, 2006-2015       | 144 |
| Figure 38: Comparison of MRHA results with related secondary data in the field of medication. | 146 |
| Figure 39: Indirect output multipliers of medication manufacturing, 2011 (1/2)                | 155 |
| Figure 40: Indirect output multipliers of medication manufacturing, 2011 (2/2)                | 157 |
| Figure 41: Indirect output effects of medication manufacturing, 2011                          | 158 |
| Figure 42: Indirect output multipliers of medical products manufacturing, 2011 (1/2)          | 159 |
| Figure 43: Indirect output multipliers of medical products manufacturing, 2011 (2/2)          | 160 |
| Figure 44: Indirect output effects of medical products manufacturing, 2011                    | 161 |
| Figure 45: Indirect output multipliers of inpatient and outpatient treatment, 2011 (1/2)      | 162 |
| Figure 46: Indirect output multipliers of inpatient and outpatient treatment, 2011 (2/2)      | 163 |
| Figure 47: Indirect output effects of inpatient and outpatient treatment, 2011                | 164 |

*List of figures*

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Figure 48: Indirect output multipliers of organic food supply, 2011 (1/2)   | 165 |
| Figure 49: Indirect output multipliers of organic food supply, 2011 (2/2)   | 166 |
| Figure 50: Indirect output effects of organic food supply, 2011   | 167 |
| Figure 51: Indirect output multipliers of health tourism, 2011 (1/2)  | 168 |
| Figure 52: Indirect output multipliers of health tourism, 2011 (2/2)  | 169 |
| Figure 53: Indirect output effects of health tourism, 2011  | 170 |
| Figure 54: Expenditures per insured people for publicly insured people (left) and adjusted expenditures for publicly insured people (right), 2009 | 175 |
| Figure 55: Preliminary calculations of the German equalization scheme for 2016.   | 178 |
| Figure 56: GDP, adjusted costs of hospitals and public investments in hospitals, 1991-2015  | 181 |
| Figure 57: Investment ratio of hospitals in federal states, 2015 (left); investment sum 1991-2015 per hospital bed (right)                        | 182 |
| Figure 58: Projected old-age dependency ratio, 2030 (left); change of hospital cases 2008-2030 (right)  | 184 |
| Figure 59: Multiregional input-output table in a 3-region-economy   | 190 |
| Figure 60: vfa member sites and their subsidiaries in 2015  | 208 |

## List of tables

|          |   |     |
|----------|---|-----|
| Table 1: | Definition of the health economy with respect to product groups and industries            | 48  |
| Table 2: | Matching of GP and EGW classifications on international trade                             | 88  |
| Table 3: | Calculated interregional trade balances and data on international trade balances for 2011 | 90  |
| Table 4: | Numerical example on the assumption of origins of manufactured health products.           | 98  |
| Table 5: | Direct overall interdependencies of German federal states in M. €, 2011                   | 152 |
| Table 6: | Direct overall interdependencies of German federal states in percentage shares, 2011      | 153 |
| Table 7: | Exemplary results of the allocation mechanism.  | 193 |
| Table 8: | Direct & indirect GVA effects from patient treatment in the rest of country.              | 196 |
| Table 9: | Relationship of patient treatment and hospital investments.                               | 199 |





## Abbreviations

|       |   |
|-------|---|
| AFLQ  | <i>Augmented Flegg's location quotient</i>  |
| CHARM | <i>Cross-Hauling Adjusted Regionalization Method</i>  |
| CN    | <i>Combined Nomenclature</i>  |
| CPA   | <i>Classification of Products by Activity</i>   |
| EGW   | <i>Warengruppen der Ernährungswirtschaft und der Gewerblichen Wirtschaft (Classification by Commodity Groups and Subgroups of the Food Industry and Trade and Industry)</i> |
| ESA   | <i>European system of accounts</i>  |
| EU    | <i>European Union</i>   |
| EVS   | <i>Einkommens- und Verbrauchsstichprobe (Income and Consumption Survey)</i>   |
| FLQ   | <i>Flegg's location quotient</i>  |
| GDP   | <i>Gross domestic product</i>   |
| GP    | <i>Güterverzeichnis für Produktionsstatistiken (Product Classification for Production Statistics)</i>   |
| GVA   | <i>Gross Value Added</i>  |
| HIOT  | <i>Health Input-Output Table</i>  |
| HSA   | <i>Health Satellite Account</i>   |
| MR    | <i>Multiregional</i>  |
| MRHA  | <i>Multiregional Health Account</i>   |
| NACE  | <i>Nomenclature statistique des activités économiques dans la Communauté européenne</i>   |
| NHA   | <i>National Health Account</i>  |
| R&D   | <i>Research and Development</i>   |
| RoC   | <i>Rest of Country</i>  |
| SHA   | <i>System of Health Accounts</i>  |
| SNA   | <i>System of National Accounts</i>  |
| SUT   | <i>Supply and Use Table</i>   |
| TLS   | <i>Taxes less subsidies</i>   |
| WA    | <i>Warenverzeichnis für die Außenhandelsstatistik (Commodity Classification for Foreign Trade Statistics)</i>   |



## Country codes

|    |                                      |
|----|--------------------------------------|
| BW | <i>Baden-Württemberg</i>             |
| BY | <i>Bavaria</i>                       |
| BE | <i>Berlin</i>                        |
| BB | <i>Brandenburg</i>                   |
| HB | <i>Bremen</i>                        |
| HH | <i>Hamburg</i>                       |
| HE | <i>Hesse</i>                         |
| MV | <i>Mecklenburg-Western Pomerania</i> |
| NI | <i>Lower Saxony</i>                  |
| NW | <i>North Rhine Westphalia</i>        |
| RP | <i>Rhineland Palatinate</i>          |
| SL | <i>Saarland</i>                      |
| SN | <i>Saxony</i>                        |
| ST | <i>Saxony-Anhalt</i>                 |
| SH | <i>Schleswig-Holstein</i>            |
| TH | <i>Thuringia</i>                     |

